

Recommendations Relevant to MCA-Vanuatu 2008 and 2009 Independent Data Quality Reviews

As part of the monitoring and evaluation close-out strategy, MCA-Vanuatu's written responses to the recommendations of the February 2008 and December 2009 data quality reviews will be formally documented and posted to the MCA-Vanuatu Web site in compliance with the May 12, 2009 MCC Policy for Monitoring and Evaluation of Compacts and Threshold Programs.

As per the December 2009 Data Quality Audit, the status of the Data Quality Auditor's recommendations for the improvement of data quality are listed in the Action Items Table noted below.

2009 Data Quality Action Items Table

| Recommendation | | Responsible Party | Action Taken | Projected Completion Date | Date Completed |
|----------------|---|---|--|---------------------------|-----------------|
| 1 | HIES 2010: Longer training of supervisors and enumerators; emphasis on the importance of the daily diary component and its full and accurate completion | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | VNSO supervisor and enumerator training extended from one week (HIES 2006) to two weeks for HIES 2010 | 1-30 Sept 2010 | 13-24 Sept 2010 |
| 2 | HIES 2010: Elimination of non-vital areas of questionnaire to reduce respondent burden | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | VNSO have since eliminated non-vital areas of the questionnaire we mentioned that we have excluded questions on the distance to these services. The main reasoning for this was that the information provided in the last HIES was not fully utilised and that the | 1- 30 Sept 2010 | 10 Sept 2010 |

| | | | | | |
|---|--|---|---|---|---|
| | | | <p>responses also were problematic many people do not really know how to calculate distances.</p> <p>VNSO have since developed an alternative approach to map the facilities using the Global Positioning System (GPS). The idea was that this information could be utilised using GIS technique to calculate distance from areas of interest.</p> | | |
| 3 | HIES 2010: More frequent visits to encourage households to complete the daily diary | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | <p>Each enumerator will be responsible for at least 3 “Workloads” for a period of 3 months. A workload is 10 households which mean there is one workload per month (10 households). An enumerator is required to do 30 households for 3 months. Supervisors will have at least 2 enumerators to supervise.</p> <p>The duration of the survey will be for 3 months commencing on the 11th October 2010 and expected to end on the 2nd week of January 2011.</p> | 1 Oct 2010 (start date of fieldwork) | 28 Feb 2011 (end date of field work) |
| 4 | HIES 2010: Remove large cash purchases from the diary and to include these in the list of purchases in the household questionnaire (section 6) | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | This activity will be done during the Data Editing stage of the questionnaire work plan. The VNSO is also tasked with testing alternatives to improve the pricing of ‘subsistence’ production and consumption. | 28 Feb 2011 (projected end date of Data Editing stage) | |
| 5 | HIES 2010: Analysis of major cash purchases found in diaries should be undertaken in order to amend the list of major purchases in the 2011 HIES | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | This activity will be done during the Data Editing stage of the questionnaire work plan. The VNSO is also tasked with testing | 28 Feb 2011 (projected end date of Data Editing | |

| | | | | | |
|---|--|---|---|---|-----|
| | | | alternatives to improve the pricing of 'subsistence' production and consumption. | stage) | |
| 6 | HIES 2010: Conduct of a panel survey in 2011 to reduce the impact of using two sets of independent sampling errors when comparing change between the two surveys. | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | Not in the current work plan of scheduled HIES 2010 activities, however, this activity will be carried out in early 2011 with datasets during Data Editing stages. | 28 Feb 2011 (projected end date of Data Editing stage) | |
| 7 | HIES 2010: Full metadata should be completed. | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | This activity has already begun and will be completed within the first quarter of 2011. It is already scheduled in the HEIS 2010 work plan. It should also be noted that VNSO have been involved in ongoing capacity building training with the Secretariat of the Pacific Community (SPC) to trial a new World Bank metadata software that VNSO can continue to use for all future statistical undertakings. | 31 Mar 2011 (projected end date of Analysis and Report writing) | |
| 8 | HIES 2010: Survey should be conducted during the same months as the 2006 survey to avoid distortions due to seasonality. | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | Originally, HIES 2010 was scheduled to be carried out in 2011 during the same months as 2006 HIES, however, owing to the MCA-V Compact end date of 28 April 2011, and as per the IEA between MCA and VNSO, the HIES was brought forward to 2010. | N/A | N/A |
| 9 | HIES 2010: Exactly the same method of calculating poverty should be used for the 2010 HIES; therefore the methodology used should be clearly documented in a manner which will enable the same process to be followed in 2010. | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | Not in the current work plan of scheduled HIES 2010 activities, as at present there is an independent consultant who has been contracted by MCA to analyse the Poverty Line using 2006 HIES data. The issue of calculating poverty | 31 Dec 2010 | |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--|---|--|--|
| | | | <p>has been discussed with different relevant government agencies, as well MCA and MCC who are in the process of procuring an international specialist to assist with developing a National Basic Needs Poverty Line for Vanuatu using 2010 HIES information with VNSO. It is expected that this study will be calculated using the same methodology as the 2009 study did.</p> | | |
|--|--|--|---|--|--|

| Recommendation | Responsible Party | Action Taken | Projected Completion Date | Date Completed |
|---|---|--|--|----------------|
| 10 HIES 2010: An expert who is skilled in developing country poverty estimation should be recruited in 2010 to a) estimate and compare the changes in poverty using a common methodology and b) estimate the sampling error around the estimates. | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | Not in the current work plan of scheduled HIES 2010 activities, however, this has been discussed with different relevant government agencies, as well MCA and MCC who are in the process of procuring an international specialist to assist with developing a National Basic Needs Poverty Line for Vanuatu using 2010 HIES information with VNSO and the independent consultant procured to carry out the MCA Poverty Line study in 2009. | 31 Dec 2010 | |
| 11 HIES 2010: Much better collection of local prices is needed at the time of data collection as is the calibration (weight or volume) of non-standard units such as baskets of produce. Prices and weights are needed to standardize nationally, the value per unit of the home grown commodities consumed by households | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | Price Guide method has been implemented for personal expenditures and personal consumption levels. The standardization has been carried out at a Provincial level (national level being too difficult owing to the geography and different perceptions of values across all the islands). The Provincial produce markets and shops' prices have been adopted for the Price Guide for HIES 2010. | 31 July 2010 | 10 Aug 2010 |
| 12 HIES 2010: Prices and weights are needed to standardize nationally, the value per unit of the home grown commodities consumed by households | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | See note in #11 above. | 31 July 2010 | 10 Aug 2010 |
| 13 HIES 2010: A major revision should be made to the baseline numbers of workers (paid employees, self-employed and unpaid family workers) in service industries in Santo and Efate using the results from the HIES. | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | This has been carried out through the following data reports: 1) Vanuatu National Accounts 2011 (using MCA-V estimates | 30 Sept 2011 (projected publication | |

| | | | | | |
|----|--|---|--|---|-----|
| | | | and figures) 2) Vanuatu CPI 2009 (in terms of weighting against different years for comparison) 3) Republic of Vanuatu Population Census 2009 (report just released August 2010) | date of National Accounts Report for previous year) | |
| 14 | HIES 2010: Abandon the business survey carried out by TRIP consultants and replace this with a hotels survey or a business survey in collaboration with NSO. | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | This has not happened as the contract to carry out tourism surveys for MCA was awarded to an independent Contractor (TRIP Consultants) who are not obliged to consult or collaborate with VNSO to carry out any survey work, and this Recommendation was only made known to both parties well after the independent consultant had drafted their final business survey sessions as per their 4 year contract with MCA. This issue has been discussed with MCA, MCC, government agencies, and other donor partners in an effort for all statistical coordination to come through VNSO for advisement and possible collaboration to avoid invalid or inappropriate survey activities in Vanuatu. | N/A | N/A |
| 15 | HIES 2010: The VNSO should consider an alternative means of estimating the contribution of tourism to GDP estimates. | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | This is not in the HIES 2010 work plan, however it is something that NSO are now working towards with the Pacific Islands Forum Secretariat Technical Assistance Cooperation (PFTAC IMF) program, and through the Department of Tourism, and Vanuatu Tourism Office | 2011 (and ongoing) | |
| 16 | HIES 2010: The roadside enterprise survey should also be added as a more direct measure of roadside enterprise and employment | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | VNSO have no problem with adding this into the HIES 2010, | N/A | N/A |

| | | | | | |
|----|--|---|---|-----|-----|
| | generation. | | however, this survey was carried out solely by MCAV in 2008, and any reporting on this study was not made available to VNSO. VNSO was approached prior to the Roadside Enterprise Survey for advisement and information on existing businesses along the roads from VNSO datasets. It should be noted that this information will be covered in the 2011 Formal and Informal Sector Survey that VNSO plan to carry out in 2011. | | |
| 17 | HIES 2010: Any future survey (Tourism Business Data) should be conducted in collaboration with the NSO and under the auspices of the statistics law to enable the company names to be released to the statistical authorities. | Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO) | This issue has been discussed with MCA, MCC, government agencies, and other donor partners in an effort for all statistical coordination to come through VNSO for advisement and possible collaboration to avoid invalid or inappropriate survey activities in Vanuatu. The VNSO have since restructured their Department and have created a new section called Statistical Leadership and Coordination Unit to oversee such issues. | N/A | N/A |

| Recommendation | Responsible Party | Action Taken | Projected Completion Date | Date Completed |
|--|---|---|--|---|
| <p>18</p> <p>Formal and Informal Sector Survey: Recommended intermediate indicators include:</p> <p>Number of enterprises situated on the Efate Ring Road</p> <p>Number of persons employed in enterprises situated on the Efate Ring Road</p> <p>Number of enterprises situated on the Santo East Coast Road</p> <p>Number of persons employed in enterprises situated on the Santo East Coast Road</p> | <p>Vanuatu National Statistics Office (VNSO), MCA-V (M&E Officer)</p> | <p>These four indicators have since been included into the 2010 M&E Plan and VNSO plan to gather information on these indicators in the 2011 Formal and Informal Sector Survey.</p> | <p>May 2011 (TBC – this survey has been moved to next year given the large amount of staffing resources, and capacities that VNSO have had to make available for the 2010 HIES .</p> | <p>Mid 2011 (To be confirmed by VNSO)</p> |

| Recommendation | | Responsible Party | Action Taken | Projected Completion Date | Date Completed |
|----------------|---|---|--|---------------------------|----------------|
| 19 | Tourism Research Investment and Planning Consultants: Recommended intermediate indicators include: | | | | |
| | Number of international air visitors traveling to other parts of Efate. | International Air Departures Tourism Survey | In order to comply with recommendations of December 2009 Data Quality Audit, MCAV has included this indicator at the outcome level to track percentages of international visitor numbers to areas outside Port Vila, in particular the Efate Ring Road area. This indicator was incorporated into MCAV's 21 st September Revised M&E Plan. | 10 Sept2010 | 21 Sept 2010 |
| | Percentage of international air visitors traveling to other parts of Efate. | | | | |
| | Number of Efate cruise visitors traveling to other parts of Efate. | Cruise Ship Tourism Survey | In order to comply with recommendations of December 2009 Data Quality Audit, MCAV has included this indicator at the outcome level to track percentage of international Cruise visitor numbers to areas outside Port Vila, in particular the Efate Ring Road area. This indicator was incorporated into MCAV's 21 st September Revised M&E Plan. | 10 Sept 2010 | 21 Sept 2010 |
| | Percentage of Efate cruise visitors traveling to other parts of Efate. | | | | |
| | Number of international air visitors traveling to Santo. | Domestic Air Departures Tourism Survey | In order to comply with recommendations of December 2009 Data Quality Audit, MCAV has included this indicator at the outcome level to track percentage of international visitor numbers to areas outside of Luganville, in particular the Santo East Coast Road area. This indicator was incorporated into MCAV's 21 st September Revised M&E Plan. | 10 Sept2010 | 21 Sept 2010 |
| | Percentage of international air visitors traveling to Santo. | | | | |
| | | | | | |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|---|---|--------------|--------------|
| | | | | | |
| | Total expenditure of international visitors by air (USD) | International Air Departures Tourism Survey | In order to comply with recommendations of December 2009 Data Quality Audit, MCAV has included this indicator at the outcome level to track total expenditure of international air visitors. The information will be tracked using information from the International Air Departures Tourism Survey that TRIP Consultants carry out. This indicator was incorporated into MCAV's 21 st September Revised M&E Plan. | 10 Sept 2010 | 21 Sept 2010 |

| Recommendation | Responsible Party | Action Taken | Projected Completion Date | Date Completed | |
|-----------------------|---|--|--|--|---------------|
| 22 | TRIP consultants divert their contract resources away from the Business Survey to a specific hotels census or to supporting a VNSO managed enterprise survey. The proposed hotel census should cover all hotels in Efate and those in Luganville and in the catchment of the Santo East Coast Road. | Tourism Research Investment and Planning Consultants | <p>Business Survey Final Questionnaire Amended to reflect Data Quality Auditor recommendations.</p> <p>Amended Business Survey being undertaken. Hotel Census option discussed with National Statistics Office and MCA. Hotel Census option rejected by MCA as budget and timing implications not considered in the DQA Report and therefore not considered practical.</p> <p>Technically, the Business Survey is also required to estimate value added, which TRIP Consultants consider a Hotel Census would not achieve.</p> | <p>December 2009</p> <p>January 2011</p> | December 2010 |

| Recommendation | | Responsible Party | Action Taken | Projected Completion Date | Date Completed |
|----------------|---|--|--|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| 20 | Roadside Enterprise Survey: methodology for the roadside enterprise survey should be written up in a report that will allow the survey to be replicated. | MCA-Vanuatu: M&E Officer | Owing to limited staffing capacity and time constraints within MCAV at the time, this was not completed, however, the results were analysed. MCAV has decided to use this survey as a baseline for the Formal Informal Survey that is now being replicated by VNSO in 2011. | N/A | N/A |
| 21 | Number of new hotel rooms constructed: This indicator should be abandoned due to insufficient quality because of the lack of cooperation of hoteliers. | MCA-Vanuatu: M&E Officer | As per Recommendations in DQA II this indicator has been abandoned | August 2010 | 21 Sept 2010 |
| 22 | TRIP consultants divert their contract resources away from the Business Survey to a specific hotels census or to supporting a VNSO managed enterprise survey. The proposed hotel census should cover all hotels in Efate and those in Luganville and in the catchment of the Santo East Coast Road. | Tourism Research Investment and Planning Consultants | <p>Business Survey Final Questionnaire Amended to reflect Data Quality Auditor recommendations.</p> <p>Amended Business Survey being undertaken. Hotel Census option discussed with National Statistics Office and MCA. Hotel Census option rejected by MCA as budget and timing implications not considered in the DQA Report and therefore not considered practical.</p> <p>Technically, the Business Survey is also required to estimate value added, which TRIP Consultants consider a Hotel Census would not achieve.</p> | <p>Dec 2009</p> <p>January 2011</p> | Dec 2010 |
| 23 | Number of International Tourists (arrivals) per annum: The baseline number should be revised to conform to the official published data. | MCA-Vanuatu: M&E Officer | This will be discussed and rectified through the administrative changes | 15 Oct 2010 | Jan 2011 onwards as official |

| | | | | | |
|----|---|--|---|---|--|
| | | | procedures for the 2010 M&E Plan between the MCA M&E Officer and the MCC M&E Director | | published data becomes available |
| 24 | Traffic volume: The M & E Plan should clearly indicate that the indicator refers to the sum of the average number of vehicles passing over selected checkpoints on the road concerned. | MCA-Vanuatu: M&E Officer | This has been incorporated into the description section of the 2010 M&E Plan. | August 2010 | 21 September 2010 |
| 25 | Origin and Destination Survey: The enumerators should be fully trained and supervised during the survey. Written instructions are needed for the interviewers, and better quality control and editing of the data is needed to eliminate erroneous dates from the dataset.. | MCA-Vanuatu: M&E Officer | MCA and ESU at PWD are planning on carrying out this survey activity coincidental with the March Traffic Counts on both roads, and are endeavouring to revise the current questionnaire and content to fit the objectives and expected outcomes of this survey for both MCA and PWD purposes. As part of the revised questionnaires and training manuals, MCAV and PWD will be putting efforts into strengthening the enumerator training and ensuring tighter data quality controls over the datasets. MCA and PWD will seek advisement from VNSO before proceeding with these activities to ensure these issues have been properly addressed. | March 2011 | March 2011 |
| 26 | Origin and Destination Survey: Interviews should coincide with the traffic counters activity; this will ensure that the weighting procedures relate the interviews to the physical counts of data. Account should be taken of the presence of cruise ships in the islands. | MCA-Vanuatu: M&E Officer | See Remarks in #25 | March 2011 | March 2011 |
| 27 | Traffic Counts: MCA economist will require additional support and equipment to undertake the data collection to the quality standards require | MCA-Vanuatu: M&E Officer and Engineering Support Unit of the Public Works Department | MCA, with ESU and Downer EDI Works (in Efate only) have successfully resumed and completed two traffic counts during the month of September 2010 on Efate and Santo. Efate was conducted using manual tally | September 2010 (ongoing until end of Compact on 28April 2011) | 20 – 26 th September 2010 (two more counts scheduled for Dec 2010 and March 2011) |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--|---|--|--|
| | | | sheets, and Santo also using manual tally sheets, as well as testing 3 automatic counters. There were two enumerators on each site, with daily supervision from MCA and ESU (Santo) and Downer EDI Downer Works and MCA (Efate) | | |
|--|--|--|---|--|--|

| Recommendation | | Responsible Party | Action Taken | Projected Completion Date | Date Completed |
|-----------------------|---|--|--|---|--------------------------|
| 28 | Share of road length in 'fair condition': Score which does not represent the true baseline condition of the road | MCA-Vanuatu: M&E Officer and Public Works Department | As per Recommendations in DQA II this indicator has been abandoned in favour of calculating International Roughness Index (IRI) of both roads. The full description of this indicator is contained in MCAV M&E Plan 2010. | September 2010 | 21 September 2010 |
| 29 | Annual PWD Score: Quality constraints are more likely to lead to unrealistically low scores rather than high scores. | MCA-Vanuatu: M&E Officer | As per Recommendations in DQA II this indicator has been abandoned in favour of more relevant indicators at the process milestones level. The full descriptions of these new indicators for Institutional Strengthening are contained in MCAV M&E Plan 2010. | September 2010 | 21 September 2010 |
| 30 | PWD Maintenance Crews: There should be further training in form-filling for all those involved in reporting on progress of road maintenance, and the ways in which maintenance of road sections are measured and reported should be standardized. | MCA-Vanuatu Roads Assessment, Maintenance and Management (RAMM) Consultant | As per Recommendations in DQA II this indicator has been included at the process milestones level in the MCAV M&E Plan 2010. Currently, Maintenance Crew training is being carried out by EDI Downer Works and MCAV with PWD personnel working through road maintenance manuals developed by Downer which include progress reporting on road maintenance, managing equipment and community contracts for cyclical maintenance. | August 2010 (training is expected to last 1 month from beginning to end of August 2010, and then to continue on after September through the RAMM Consultant | Scheduled for April 2011 |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|------------------------|--|
| | | | | until 28 April 2011 | |
|--|--|--|--|------------------------|--|